WO

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTICT OF ARIZONA

IN RE: Bard IVC Filters Products Liability Litigation,

No. MDL 15-02641-PHX-DGC

**CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NO. 49** 

Pursuant to Case Management Order ("CMO") No. 48 (Doc. 21740), the parties have filed status reports identifying previously dismissed cases that are ripe for reinstatement. Docs. 21750 at 2, 21776 at 2 & n.2. A number of cases were voluntarily dismissed without prejudice and without being settled, the parties having entered into a tolling agreement so they could continue settlement discussions outside the confines of this MDL. See Doc. 21526 at 1-2. Some Plaintiffs in these cases have since opted out of the proposed settlements. See id. Because CMO 42 – which governs the settlement process in this MDL – does not permit cases that have failed to settle to be dismissed from the MDL without prejudice only to be refiled as new cases, the Court has concluded that the dismissal orders in these opt-out cases must be vacated and the cases reinstated in the MDL. See Docs. 16343, 21527, 2154. After reinstatement, the cases will be remanded or transferred to appropriate courts for further litigation consistent with the MDL of which they have been a part. See Doc. 21740 at 2.

On January 27, 2021, a telephonic status hearing was held to address 217 dismissed cases in which the Plaintiffs had not accepted or opted out of settlements. *See id.* at 3;

Doc. 21734 at 5-6. Of the 217 cases at issue, counsel state that thirteen Plaintiffs have accepted the settlement and four have chosen to opt-out. Doc. 21776 at 2. Plaintiffs in the remaining 200 cases either cannot be located, are not responding to counsel's inquiries, are deceased with no known heirs, or have not yet made a decision on the offered settlements. *Id.* at 2-4.

The Court will grant counsel's request to continue until March 15, 2021 their efforts to locate, contact, and secure settlement decisions from these Plaintiffs. As stated on the record and agreed to by counsel for both sides, the Court will dismiss with prejudice any cases in which, by March 15, 2021, the Plaintiffs or their heirs cannot be located, the Plaintiffs remain non-responsive, or the Plaintiffs fail to make a settlement decision. These cases will be dismissed with prejudice for failure to prosecute. *See* Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(b).

#### IT IS ORDERED:

- 1. The dismissal orders in the cases listed on Attachment A are **vacated**. The Clerk is directed to reinstate each case in this MDL.
- 2. Settlement decisions from the Plaintiffs in the remaining 200 dismissed cases (*see* Doc. 21776) must be made by **March 15, 2021**.
- 3. A telephonic hearing is set for **March 19, 2021 at 2:00 p.m.** Plaintiffs' counsel shall file an updated status report, and provide the dial-in information for the hearing to counsel for all parties and the Court, no later than **5:00 p.m. on March 17, 2021**.

David G. Camplell

David G. Campbell

Senior United States District Judge

Dated this 1st day of February, 2021.

#### In Re Bard IVC Filter Products Liability Litigation, No. MDL 15-2641

### Order Vacating Dismissal Orders and Reinstating Cases in the MDL (February 1, 2021)

#### **Attachment A to CMO 49**

| Plaintiffs            | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Burroughs, Ronnie D   | 2:19-cv-00459-PHX-DGC | 20896                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Coats, Russell        | 2:16-cv-02136-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Davis, Donald         | 2:19-cv-03501-PHX-DGC | 20988                            | 12/9/2019         |
| Keene, Thomas         | 2:17-cv-03996-PHX-DGC | 21217                            | 1/9/2020          |
| Thomas, Vincent Wayne | 2:16-cv-01221-PHX-DGC | 20990                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Paxton, James A       | 2:17-cv-01775-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Sutton, Rodney V      | 2:17-cv-02208-PHX-DGC | 21014                            | 12/18/2019        |
| Wilhite, Cindy Denise | 2:17-cv-01933-PHX-DGC | 21017                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Contreras, Junnigh    | 2:17-cv-00857-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Dew, John             | 2:19-cv-01873-PHX-DGC | 21047                            | 1/10/2020         |
| Lee, Rumell Gerard    | 2:19-cv-01136-PHX-DGC | 20900                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Vanderupwich, Robert  | 2:19-cv-00145-PHX-DGC | 21005                            | 12/17/2019        |
| Williams, Juanita L   | 2:19-cv-01646-PHX-DGC | 21017                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Encalade, Tammy       | 2:18-cv-04558-PHX-DGC | 20897                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Lee, Micheline Elaine | 2:19-cv-03977-PHX-DGC | 20999                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Lee, Mister JC        | 2:19-cv-01897-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Olsen, Joseph E       | 2:18-cv-02044-PHX-DGC | 20987                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Smith, James B        | 2:18-cv-01831-PHX-DGC | 21002                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Leyva, Elizabeth      | 2:16-cv-01758-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Ortiz, Rosa           | 2:19-cv-04229-PHX-DGC | 21269                            | 1/13/2020         |

| Plaintiffs                   | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Perez, Manuel                | 2:17-cv-01064-PHX-DGC | 20981                            | 12/10/2019        |
| Dengler, Mary                | 2:18-cv-00592-PHX-DGC | 20974                            | 12/10/2019        |
| Forbes, Christopher L        | 2:19-cv-00464-PHX-DGC | 20897                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Fletcher, Louis Floyd        | 2:16-cv-01820-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Bernstein, Helene            | 2:16-cv-01775-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Coleman, Curtis E            | 2:17-cv-03698-PHX-DGC | 20897                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Conner, Franklin Glenn       | 2:17-cv-04387-PHX-DGC | 20978                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Hepler, Kim M                | 2:16-cv-00630-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Hunter, Kemene A             | 2:18-cv-04369-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Jordan, Eileen               | 2:18-cv-01343-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Loewer, Sr, Sean Parker      | 2:17-cv-02966-PHX-DGC | 21045                            | 1/10/2020         |
| Shockley, Sr, William Joseph | 2:18-cv-00314-PHX-DGC | 21001                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Tait, Virginia               | 2:19-cv-03028-PHX-DGC | 21002                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Trenkle, Angel Damaris       | 2:19-cv-01018-PHX-DGC | 21002                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Turner, Janet V              | 2:19-cv-01233-PHX-DGC | 20972                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Hiatt, Neal                  | 2:19-cv-00799-PHX-DGC | 21045                            | 1/10/2020         |
| MacEachern, David A          | 2:17-cv-02497-PHX-DGC | 21419                            | 1/31/2020         |
| Chery, Antoine J             | 2:18-cv-03523-PHX-DGC | 20896                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Haas, James                  | 2:17-cv-04177-PHX-DGC | 21037                            | 12/30/2019        |
| Pinckney, VaRawn             | 2:19-cv-01964-PHX-DGC | 21033                            | 12/18/2019        |
| Sherwin, Louis Lee           | 2:16-cv-03962-PHX-DGC | 21017                            | 1/3/2020          |

| Plaintiffs                | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|---------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Weber, III, Louis Henry   | 2:19-cv-01169-PHX-DGC | 21004                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Jester, Dena J            | 2:19-cv-03945-PHX-DGC | 20999                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Dukes, Benjamin           | 2:18-cv-03629-PHX-DGC | 20897                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Jackson, Edna M           | 2:18-cv-03427-PHX-DGC | 20996                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Jett, John                | 2:18-cv-03634-PHX-DGC | 20685                            | 10/25/2019        |
| Johnson-Winfrey, Sophelia | 2:17-cv-04301-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Williams, Tamika E        | 2:15-cv-01956-PHX-DGC | 21017                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Kirkland, Jr, Robert      | 2:17-cv-03936-PHX-DGC | 20974                            | 12/10/2019        |
| Mathis, Reginald          | 2:17-cv-03469-PHX-DGC | 20998                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Turner, John Trevor       | 2:16-cv-00816-PHX-DGC | 20978                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Grant, James L            | 2:17-cv-04425-PHX-DGC | 20978                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Schneider, Charles A      | 2:18-cv-01691-PHX-DGC | 21001                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Ostap, Jerry A            | 2:16-cv-02342-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Zeledon, Frank            | 2:18-cv-04423-PHX-DGC | 20902                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Stevens, Bill R           | 2:18-cv-03823-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Godsell, Daniel E         | 2:18-cv-02091-PHX-DGC | 21014                            | 12/18/2019        |
| Foy, Darrin               | 2:19-cv-00443-PHX-DGC | 20897                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Boggs, Kristina R         | 2:19-cv-02947-PHX-DGC | 20984                            | 12/9/2019         |
| Agnelly, John             | 2:16-cv-00608-PHX-DGC | 21007                            | 12/17/2019        |
| Hall, Joshua              | 2:19-cv-01140-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Stuart, Michael B         | 2:18-cv-03381-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |

| Plaintiffs                | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|---------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Gerideau, Derick Jermaine | 2:17-cv-00411-PHX-DGC | 20990                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Realy, Paulette M         | 2:18-cv-04477-PHX-DGC | 20900                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Mills, Stephanie          | 2:16-cv-03401-PHX-DGC | 20985                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Vukovich, Linda           | 2:19-cv-00980-PHX-DGC | 21004                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Lauer, Timothy            | 2:19-cv-00113-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Nicol, James              | 2:16-cv-02853-PHX-DGC | 3815                             | 10/28/2016        |
| Henley, Ginger Geraldine  | 2:19-cv-03949-PHX-DGC | 20999                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Mace, Larry Melvin        | 2:18-cv-02731-PHX-DGC | 21271                            | 1/13/2020         |
| Barnett, Stephanie        | 2:19-cv-02875-PHX-DGC | 20984                            | 12/9/2019         |
| Morgan, Albert R          | 2:18-cv-04447-PHX-DGC | 20978                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Thomas, Carrie L          | 2:18-cv-04450-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Hamilton, Gary F          | 2:16-cv-01581-PHX-DGC | 20978                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Haralson, Candace D       | 2:19-cv-00642-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Huffman, Roger N          | 2:18-cv-03488-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Pitts, Robin              | 2:19-cv-01081-PHX-DGC | 21001                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Mitchell, Mary            | 2:19-cv-02528-PHX-DGC | 21006                            | 12/17/2019        |
| Watts, Christy A          | 2:17-cv-03449-PHX-DGC | 20902                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Terrell, Donald           | 2:18-cv-04490-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Mason, Devin L            | 2:18-cv-03768-PHX-DGC | 20900                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Parsons, Latiesha Lashea  | 2:16-cv-00887-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Ross, Charles Theodore    | 2:18-cv-03278-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |

| Plaintiffs                 | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|----------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Simpson, Bradley J         | 2:18-cv-00098-PHX-DGC | 20972                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Britt, Stephanie           | 2:18-cv-03170-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Murphy, Orndary Foster     | 2:17-cv-01225-PHX-DGC | 20987                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Stephens, Chico            | 2:19-cv-04211-PHX-DGC | 20999                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Gallegos, Anna             | 2:19-cv-03436-PHX-DGC | 20995                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Izor, William              | 2:19-cv-03495-PHX-DGC | 20996                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Edging, Michael W          | 2:17-cv-02960-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Fairchild, Patricia        | 2:17-cv-03885-PHX-DGC | 21021                            | 1/10/2020         |
| Griego, Nestor             | 2:19-cv-00929-PHX-DGC | 20981                            | 12/10/2019        |
| Benitez, Shashawna E Jones | 2:16-cv-04111-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Costanzo, Nicole           | 2:17-cv-00460-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Edwards, Monica            | 2:16-cv-02785-PHX-DGC | 21015                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Murphy, Cecilia            | 2:19-cv-01924-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Turner, Clevon             | 2:19-cv-02029-PHX-DGC | 21017                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Forkey, Ann M              | 2:18-cv-01938-PHX-DGC | 20995                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Pasha, Yusef S             | 2:17-cv-03899-PHX-DGC | 21030                            | 1/9/2020          |
| Rhoden, Sr, Hugh M         | 2:19-cv-00593-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Vails, Eleanor L           | 2:17-cv-03413-PHX-DGC | 20902                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Amatore, Rosalie M         | 2:17-cv-03864-PHX-DGC | 21018                            | 1/8/2020          |
| McGreath, John             | 2:19-cv-00659-PHX-DGC | 20900                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Burrows, Jr, Albert W      | 2:18-cv-01645-PHX-DGC | 21048                            | 12/30/2019        |

| Plaintiffs             | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Mattwig, Michael J     | 2:17-cv-01505-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Overton, Victoria      | 2:18-cv-00150-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Shehadeh, Abdel Hameed | 2:18-cv-00768-PHX-DGC | 21424                            | 1/31/2020         |
| Smith, Carol           | 2:19-cv-00904-PHX-DGC | 21002                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Liston, Jessica        | 2:19-cv-01167-PHX-DGC | 20998                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Allen, George R        | 2:17-cv-03484-PHX-DGC | 20896                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Deane, Betsie C        | 2:17-cv-03288-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Guiteras, Gregory      | 2:18-cv-02495-PHX-DGC | 20995                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Holmes, Troy A         | 2:17-cv-03841-PHX-DGC | 21023                            | 1/8/2020          |
| James, Priscilla       | 2:17-cv-01951-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Confer, Sr, Robert E   | 2:17-cv-04678-PHX-DGC | 21020                            | 1/8/2020          |
| Henry, James E         | 2:16-cv-00228-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Kissinger, David A     | 2:17-cv-03074-PHX-DGC | 20660                            | 10/29/2019        |
| Samuels, Robert A      | 2:19-cv-00658-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Lanham, Jasson T       | 2:18-cv-03699-PHX-DGC | 20900                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Morgan, James Ronald   | 2:16-cv-04109-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Tanner, Laura C        | 2:17-cv-03988-PHX-DGC | 21005                            | 12/17/2019        |
| Buchanan, Barbara      | 2:16-cv-02090-PHX-DGC | 20973                            | 12/4/2019         |
| Cole, Samuel           | 2:19-cv-01413-PHX-DGC | 21424                            | 1/31/2020         |
| Royston, Larry D       | 2:17-cv-03423-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Adams, Timothy Ora     | 2:19-cv-01078-PHX-DGC | 21099                            | 12/9/2019         |

| Plaintiffs            | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| McNeal, Curtisteen    | 2:17-cv-03642-PHX-DGC | 20900                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Cobb, Lance Anthony   | 2:18-cv-04691-PHX-DGC | 21038                            | 12/30/2019        |
| Phillips, Jimmy       | 2:19-cv-02270-PHX-DGC | 21424                            | 1/31/2020         |
| Buie, Hal Wesley      | 2:19-cv-00759-PHX-DGC | 20984                            | 12/9/2019         |
| Gordon, Beulah        | 2:19-cv-03411-PHX-DGC | 20995                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Hayes, Curley Gene    | 2:16-cv-02061-PHX-DGC | 21041                            | 1/14/2020         |
| Miller, Ben           | 2:19-cv-01437-PHX-DGC | 21003                            | 1/2/2020          |
| Moore, Carlton Lamon  | 2:19-cv-00165-PHX-DGC | 20987                            | 1/7/2020          |
| Vela, Jeffery S       | 2:18-cv-02941-PHX-DGC | 20902                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Ameel, Alexis A       | 2:16-cv-02766-PHX-DGC | 20983                            | 12/5/2019         |
| Barker, James A       | 2:17-cv-03656-PHX-DGC | 20896                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Fontenot, Effie       | 2:18-cv-01166-PHX-DGC | 20995                            | 1/6/2020          |
| Irwin, Alvis Lynn     | 2:17-cv-03084-PHX-DGC | 20898                            | 11/21/2019        |
| Robinson, Lonnie Mae  | 2:19-cv-02547-PHX-DGC | 21108                            | 12/11/2019        |
| Timberlake, Calvin R  | 2:16-cv-03999-PHX-DGC | 21017                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Floyd, Kenneth        | 2:19-cv-02526-PHX-DGC | 21006                            | 12/17/2019        |
| Savetwith, Susan L    | 2:18-cv-03465-PHX-DGC | 21038                            | 12/30/2019        |
| Crum, Terry G         | 2:19-cv-00630-PHX-DGC | 20897                            | 11/20/2019        |
| Ablan, Charles John   | 2:19-cv-00825-PHX-DGC | 21185                            | 1/3/2020          |
| Keaton, Terry Kenneth | 2:19-cv-03948-PHX-DGC | 21128                            | 12/16/2019        |
| Blair, Edward         | 2:16-cv-01677-PHX-DGC | 21185                            | 1/3/2020          |

#### In Re Bard IVC Filter Products Liability Litigation, No. MDL 15-2641

### Order Vacating Dismissal Orders and Reinstating Cases in the MDL (February 1, 2021)

| Plaintiffs             | Case Number           | Dismissal<br>Order<br>(Doc. No.) | Dismissal<br>Date |
|------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Jett-Williams, Sandy L | 2:18-cv-04621-PHX-DGC | 20967                            | 11/21/2019        |